

# IN THE DISTRICT COURT OF CLEVELAND COUNTY STATE OF OKLAHOMA

FILED

STATE OF OKLAHOMA S.S.

### STATE OF OKLAHOMA, ex rel., MIKE HUNTER, ATTORNEY GENERAL OF OKLAHOMA,

Plaintiff,

In the office of the Court Clerk MARILYN WILLIAMS Case No. CJ-2017-816

Judge Thad Balkman

William C. Hetherington Special Discovery Master

v.

PURDUE PHARMA L.P., et al.,

Defendants.

# OPPOSITION TO AMICUS BRIEF AND MOTION FOR INTERVENTION OF GOV.

KEVIN STITT, REP. CHARLES MCCALL, AND SEN. GREG TREAT

1

#### **INTRODUCTION**

ļ

į

|

The attempt by three Oklahoma politicians to inject themselves into a case where the Attorney General has been representing the State since the action was filed in 2017 is unnecessary, redundant, and unpersuasive. Indeed, the request by Governor Stitt, Speaker McCall, and President Pro Tempore Treat to participate as amici or intervene as of right serves no apparent purpose but to repeat arguments already made and intrude on the judicial process.

Procedurally, Applicants' motion should be denied because it lacks any valid purpose. Applicants rehash arguments that the Attorney General—their legal representative before this Court—has already mounted, and authorities that he has already cited. Because they have no different view and no different interest, Applicants fail to qualify as either amici or intervenors.

On the law, Applicants' position fails for the same reasons as the identical arguments made by the Attorney General. Applicants' misreading of the "complete relief" doctrine provides no support for their request to have the Court revisit and set aside its prior findings or the remedy in its Judgment. In selecting its remedy, this Court recognized the limits of both the trial evidence and the judicial role: It concluded that the State had failed to prove the necessity of its abatement plan beyond year one, and that any "additional programs and funding ... over an extended period of time" is a "determination to be made by our legislators and policymakers." Hr'g Tr. (Aug. 26, 2019) at 6. Applicants and the State have presented no basis for the Court to reverse those conclusions.

#### I. APPLICANTS' REPETITION OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL'S ARGUMENTS IS UNNECESSARY

Applicants' request to participate as amici or intervene as of right should be denied for a simple reason: the State's interests are already fully represented. Applicants each seek to participate in this case in their official capacity as State officers. (Applicants' Br. 1–2.) But the

State of Oklahoma is already represented by the Attorney General, who has a duty to defend "the interests of the state," 74 O.S. § 18b(A)(3), and "possesses complete dominion over every litigation in which he properly appears in the interest of the State." *State ex rel. Derryberry v. Kerr-McGee Corp.*, 1973 OK 132, ¶20, 516 P.2d 813, 818. The Attorney General has made the State's remedial objections clear, and Applicants' submission of a second brief on the State's behalf, rehashing the same arguments, serves no valid purpose—its sole function appears to be to pressure the Court to depart from the judgment it entered after a trial of more than seven weeks.

Applicants' submission does not even meet the basic criteria for participation. It fails to satisfy the requirements for amicus recognition, setting forth no "different views" that might justify Applicants' desire to appear. *Teleco, Inc. v. Corp. Comm'n of State of Okl.*, 1982 OK 93, ¶7, 649 P.2d 772, 774. Rather, it makes the exact same arguments, relies on the exact same authorities, and even repeatedly parrots the State's own brief.<sup>1</sup> If a J&J employee or board member were to file an amicus brief repeating Janssen's arguments, the State would not hesitate to label the submission as self-serving and unhelpful. Applicants' submission is no different.

Applicants likewise fail to satisfy the requirements for intervention as of right. Such intervention is permissible only where "the existing parties may not adequately represent the applicant's interest." *Brown v. Patel*, 2007 OK 16, ¶17, 157 P.3d 117, 124. Applicants do not even

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Compare Applicants' Br. 5–6 (invoking "complete relief" doctrine and citing Crushed Stone, Meinders, Speed, and Swann) with State's Br. 4 (same); compare Applicants' Br. 6 ("Those cases show, particularly in the nuisance context, that Oklahoma district courts have the obligation and the power to monitor, evaluate and, if necessary, modify the abatement process until the nuisance is abated.") with State's Br. 4 (same, verbatim); compare Applicants' Br. 5–6 ("Oklahoma nuisance law is clear that a Court retains jurisdiction in an equitable abatement to oversee and provide complete relief") with State's Br. 4 (same, verbatim).

pretend they can satisfy this standard in a case where the Attorney General has already advanced the *exact* arguments they wish to make, often using the exact same sentences, word-for-word.<sup>2</sup>

# II. PRINCIPLES OF EQUITY DO NOT SUPPORT APPLICANTS' OR THE STATE'S REQUEST FOR THE COURT TO EXPAND ITS REMEDY

Beyond the motion's procedural defects, Applicants (like the State before them) offer no justification for the Court to discard its selected remedy and usurp the policy responsibilities that it already recognized as the province of the legislature.

This Court's ruling was clear: Although the State demanded decades of funding for its proposed abatement plan, the Court found that the State "did not present sufficient evidence of the amount of time and costs necessary, beyond year one, to abate the Opioid Crisis." Judgment After Non-Jury Trial at 41, ¶60. That finding recognized the gaps in the State's evidence and the Court's need to enter a decision consistent with and supported by its findings. The Court further concluded that the need for "additional programs and funding … over an extended period of time" is a "determination to be made by our legislators and policymakers."<sup>3</sup> Hr'g Tr. (Aug. 26, 2019) at 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A motion to intervene as of right also "must be timely." *Brown*, 2007 OK 16, ¶17, 157 P.3d at 124. This motion to intervene, which comes more than two years after the commencement of this lawsuit, nearly two months after the Court announced its judgment, and two weeks after the parties argued issues related to entry of a final judgment is untimely by any standard. *See Elliott Indus. Ltd. P'ship v. BP Am. Prod. Co.*, 407 F.3d 1091, 1103 (10th Cir. 2005) ("The timeliness of a motion to intervene is assessed in light of all the circumstances, including the length of time since the applicant knew of his interest in the case."); *Bank of Commerce v. Breakers, L.L.C.*, 2011 OK CIV APP 45, ¶18, 256 P.3d 1053, 1058 (holding that a motion to intervene filed nearly a year after the intervenor was put on notice of the proceedings was "untimely as a matter of law").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In so doing, the Court recognized the widely accepted tenet that when a judge assumes longterm responsibility for government programs, "he will inevitably be required to make very broad empirical predictions necessarily based in large part upon policy views—the sort of predictions regularly made by legislators and executive officials, but inappropriate for the Third Branch." *Brown v. Plata*, 563 U.S. 493, 555 (2011) (Scalia, J., dissenting).

Dissatisfied with that ruling, the State contended for the first time after trial that principles of equity "obligate[]" this Court to hold decades of appropriations hearings to extract additional funding from Janssen. (State's Br. 28.) That demand represents a total reversal for the State, which for two years has insisted that it could prove Janssen's liability as a single lump-sum payment in one stroke. This turns the law of equity on its head, just as Applicants likewise get that law backward.

Equity is defined by remedial "flexibility." *Schnedler v. Lee*, 2019 OK 52, ¶11, 445 P.3d 238, 242. To that end, a court's "'[b]alancing of equities and hardships may lead the court to grant some equitable relief but not' the full measure requested." *Kansas v. Nebraska*, 574 U.S. 445, 465 (2015) (quoting Dobbs, Law of Remedies § 2.4(1) (2d ed. 1993)). That flexibility has historically taken the form of "a single simple act"—not indefinite jurisdiction. *Brown v. Plata*, 563 U.S. 493, 554 (2011) (Scalia, J., dissenting). As Justice Scalia explained, courts of equity eschewed "decrees which called for more than a single affirmative act." *Id.* (internal quotation marks omitted). "Once the document was turned over or the land conveyed, the litigant's obligation to the court … ceased…. The court did not engage in any ongoing supervision of the litigant's conduct, nor did its order continue to regulate his behavior." *Id.*; *see Caldwell v. Taggart*, 29 U.S. 190, 199 (1830) (the decree of a court of equity "should terminate and not instigate litigation").

Here, the State requested precisely such a one-time remedy—a \$17 billion payment—but failed to present evidence justifying "the full measure requested." *Kansas*, 574 U.S. at 465. This Court properly considered the State's demand, its trial evidence, and the separation of powers problems arising from long-term judicial control of government programs. Its decision to dispose of the case with "a single simple act," *Brown*, 563 U.S. at 554, that "'grant[s] some equitable relief but not' the full measure requested," *Kansas*, 574 U.S. at 465, conformed with historical equitable

5

remedies.<sup>4</sup> There is no merit to the State's (and Applicants') newfound contention that equity *inflexibly* compels the Court to take the helm of massive government programs for decades on end.

Applicants, like the State, base their argument for permanent, ongoing proceedings by mischaracterizing the "complete relief" doctrine. (*See* Applicants' Br. 5–6; State's Br. 4.) According to the State and Applicants, that equitable doctrine means this Court must assume openended authority for the State's abatement plan—it "cannot stop short of fully abating the temporary nuisance." (State's Br. 19; *see* Applicants' Br. 3 ("the Court cannot stop short of abating the nuisance").) What the doctrine actually holds is that a court sitting in equity has jurisdiction to issue all relief necessary—legal as well as equitable—to conclusively resolve the litigation. *See Pruitt v. Hammers*, 1955 OK 348, Syl. ¶1, 292 P.2d 157, 157 ("An action to quiet title and for possession is an equitable action, and a court of equity has jurisdiction to give complete relief, including damages, so as to avoid a multiplicity of suits."). The Court's judgment satisfied the "complete relief" doctrine by "settl[ing] all controversies growing out of the transaction forming the subject matter of the suit." *Pruitt*, 1955 OK 348, ¶9, 292 P.2d at 159. The principles of equity require nothing more.

Nor do any of the nuisance cases that Applicants and the State cite. Both *Crushed Stone Co. v. Moore*, 1962 OK 65, 369 P.2d 811, and *Meinders v. Johnson*, 2006 OK CIV APP 35, 134 P.3d 858, involved classic nuisance disputes limited to discrete pieces of real property. In the former, the trial court gave a quarry a short window to clean up its operations before ordering it to shut down. *Crushed Stone Co.*, 1962 OK 65, ¶8, 369 P.2d at 814 (cited at State's Br. 4–5, 14, 20–

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> In noting that principles of equity allow a court to dispose of a case with a single act that grants only part of the relief requested, Janssen does not waive its argument that cash transfers to address the consequences of a nuisance constitute damages rather than nuisance abatement.

22, 27–28; Applicants' Br. 6). It did so only after a trial in which the plaintiffs proved that limestone dust from the quarry was blowing onto their property, and the relevant question resolved on appeal stands only for the proposition that the remedy must conform to the proof at trial. In the latter case, *Meinders*, dicta in a footnote quoted a trial court's order that pollution "cleanup of Plaintiff's property shall go forward in phases" while the court "retain[ed] continuing jurisdiction to supervise cleanup activities." 2006 OK CIV APP 35, n.1, 134 P.3d at 861 (cited at State's Br. 4, 19, 21–22, 27–28; Applicants' Br. 6). That ongoing jurisdiction—which the Court of Civil Appeals did not address—rested on the Oklahoma Environmental Quality Act, 27A O.S. § 2-6-102, which mandates remediation of pollution in surface and subsurface water cases and is inapplicable here. Nothing in either decision suggests that decades of cash extractions and judicial policymaking are a permissible, much less compulsory, remedy in a public nuisance case.

Indeed, even *People v. ConAgra Grocery Products Co.*, 17 Cal. App. 5th 51 (2017) (cited at State's Br. 29–30)—the most expansive application of public nuisance law in American history—stopped well short of awarding such relief. The court there ordered a single, lump-sum payment for the removal of residential lead paint and instructed that "any funds that had not been utilized for that sole purpose by the end of the four-year abatement period were to be returned to the defendants." *Id.* at 132–34. It did not assume indefinite and absolute responsibility for eradicating residential lead paint in California, let alone for programmatic administration of policy-based ideas for addressing complex social and public health problems for an indeterminate length of time.

The school busing and prison reform cases that Applicants and the State rely on only underscore the practical limits to judicial intervention: Those attempts to engineer "remedies" are widely recognized as practical fiascos that overstepped the limits of judicial competence and undermined the legitimacy of the courts. *See, e.g., Lewis v. Casey*, 518 U.S. 343, 385 (1996) (Thomas, J., concurring) (reversing equitable prison injunction) ("We have here yet another example of a federal judge attempting to direct or manage the reconstruction of entire institutions and bureaucracies, with little regard for the inherent limitations on his authority.") (internal quotations and brackets omitted).

#### CONCLUSION

Applicants ask this Court to make that leap in the belief that placing the costs of an opioidremediation strategy on the State's shoulders is unfair. (Applicants' Br. 8.) But there is no precedent in American jurisprudence for the remedy they now propose—one that the State raised for the first time only after the Court entered its post-trial findings and August 26, 2019 Judgment. This Court should adhere to its reasoned conclusion, based on the theories and evidence at trial, that "[w]hether additional programs and funding are needed for an extended period of time ... are determinations to be made by [Oklahoma] legislators and policymakers." Hr'g Tr. (Aug. 26, 2019) at 6. The law demands nothing less.

#### FOLIART, HUFF, OTTAWAY & BOTTOM

Larry D. Ottaway-OBA# 6816 Amy Sherry Fischer-OBA# 16651 Andrew M. Bowman-OBA# 22071 Steven J. Johnson-OBA# 16132 201 Robert S. Kerr Avenue, 12th Floor Oklahoma City, Oklahoma 73102 Telephone: (405) 232-4633 Fax: (405) 232-3462 larryottaway@oklahomacounsel.com amyfischer@oklahomacounsel.com andrewbowman@oklahomacounsel.com Benjamin H. Odom, OBA# 10917 John H. Sparks, OBA# 15661 Michael W. Ridgeway, OBA# 15657 David L. Kinney, OBA# 10875 ODOM, SPARKS & JONES, PLLC HiPoint Office Building, Suite 140 2500 McGee Drive Norman, OK 73072 Telephone: 405-701-1863 Fax: 405-310-5394 odomb@odomsparks.com sparksj@odomsparks.com ridgewaym@odomsparks.com

Charles C. Lifland Wallace Moore Allan Sabrina H. Strong O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP 400 S. Hope Street Los Angeles, CA 90071 Tel: 213-430-6000 Fax: 213-430-6407 clifland@omm.com tallan@omm.com sstrong@omm.com

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS JANSSEN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., JOHNSON & JOHNSON, JANSSEN PHARMACEUTICA, INC. n/k/a JANSSEN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC., AND ORTHO-MCNEIL-JANSSEN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC. n/k/a JANSSEN PHARMACEUTICALS, INC.

# **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

ļ

This is to certify that on this  $\underline{12^{th}}$  day of November, 2019, a true and correct copy of the foregoing instrument was emailed as follows:

Michael Burrage, OBA #1350	Mike Hunter, OBA #4503
Reggie Whitten, OBA #9576	Abby Dillsaver, OBA #20675
J. Revell Parrish	Ethan A. Shaner, OBA #3091
WHITTEN BURRAGE	OFFICE OF ATTORNEY GENERAL FOR
512 North Broadway, Suite 300	THE STATE OF OKLAHOMA
Oklahoma City, OK 73102	313 N.E. 21 <sup>st</sup> Street
Tel: 405-516-7800	Oklahoma City, OK 73105
Fax: 405-516-7859	Tel: 405-521-3921
mburrage@whittenburragelaw.com	Fax: 405-521-6246
rwhitten@whittenburragelaw.com	mike.hunter@oag.ok.gov
rparrish@whittenburragelaw.com	abby.dillsaver@oag.ok.gov
Attorneys for Plaintiff	ethan.shaner@oag.ok.gov
	Attorneys for Plaintiff
Bradley E. Beckworth, OBA #19982	Glenn Coffee, OBA #14563
Jeffrey J. Angelovich, OBA #19981	GLENN COFFEE & ASSOCIATES, PLLC
Lloyd Nolan Duck III, OBA #33347	915 N. Robinson Ave.
Nathan B. Hall, OBA #32790	Oklahoma City, OK 73102
Andrew Pate	Tel: 405-601-1616
Lisa Baldwin	gcoffee@glenncoffee.com
Brooke A. Churchman	Attorney for Plaintiff
NIX, PATTERSON & ROACH, LLP	
512 North Broadway, Suite 200	
Oklahoma City, OK 73102	
Tel: 405-516-7800	
Fax: 405-516-7859	
bbeckworth@nixlaw.com	
jangelovich@npraustin.com	
tduck@nixlaw.com	
dpate@nixlaw.com	
Ibaldwin@nixlaw.com	
bchurchman@nixlaw.com	
nhall@nixlaw.com	
Attorneys for Plaintiff	

3600 N. Capital of Texas Highway, SuiteSan FraB350Tel: 415Austin, TX 78746Fax: 411Tel: 512-328-5333jae.lee(a)Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordSheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 400DECHERT, LLPsandy.comThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorney	T
Nix Patterson, LLPOne Bu3600 N. Capital of Texas Highway, SuiteSan FraB350Tel: 415Austin, TX 78746Fax: 411Tel: 512-328-5333jae.lee@Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmadwinncutler@nixlaw.comPharmadwinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordSheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NorLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 402DECHERT, LLPsandy.ceThree Bryant Parkjoshua.li1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparmark.cheffo@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparbert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	e
3600 N. Capital of Texas Highway, SuiteSan FraB350Tel: 415Austin, TX 78746Fax: 411jae.lee@Fax: 512-328-5333Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 401DECHERT, LLPsandy.comThree Bryant Parkjoshua.L1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparmark.cheffo@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comLlafata@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	
B350Tel: 415Austin, TX 78746Fax: 411Tel: 512-328-5333jae.lee@Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.ceThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparmark.cheffo@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comLindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comLindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comLindsay.zanello@dechert.com	sh Street, 16 <sup>th</sup> Floor
Austin, TX 78746Fax: 41:Tel: 512-328-5333jae.lee@Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 40:DECHERT, LLPsandy.ceThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comIndsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	ncisco, CA 94104
Tel: 512-328-5333jae.lee(aFax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 40DECHERT, LLPsandy.coThree Bryant Parkjoshua.t1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparmark.cheffo@dechert.comComparjonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	-262-4500
Fax: 512-328-5335Attorneyrossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffSanfordSheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahonBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 400DECHERT, LLPsandy.comThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparmark.cheffo@dechert.comComparjonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	5-262-4555
rossl@nixlaw.comPharmawinncutler@nixlaw.comComparAttorneys for PlaintiffComparSheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NorLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 401DECHERT, LLPsandy.colThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.com	dechert.com
winncutler@nixlaw.com Attorneys for PlaintiffComparSheila Birnbaum Mark S. Cheffo Hayden A. Coleman Paula A. LaFata Jonathan S. Tam Lindsay N. Zanello Bert L. WolffSanford Joshua I Braniff 324 Non Oklahor Tel: 405 Fax: 401 DECHERT, LLP Three Bryant Park 1095 Avenue of the Americas New York, NY 10036 sheila.birnbaum@dechert.com mark.cheffo@dechert.com hayden.coleman@dechert.com jonathan.tam@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.comCompar Sanford Joshua I Joshua I Braniff Sandy.com CROWI Paula A. LaFata Braniff Jonathan.tam@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.comCompar Sandy.com Sandy.co	s for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue
Attorneys for PlaintiffSanfordSheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahonBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 40DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.h1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparhayden.coleman@dechert.comComparjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.com	Inc., and The Purdue Frederick
Sheila BirnbaumSanfordMark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 401DECHERT, LLPsandy.cdThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparejonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.com	y Inc.
Mark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 401DECHERT, LLPsandy.corThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmatsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comComparejonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	
Mark S. CheffoJoshua IHayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 401DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmatsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comComparejonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	
Hayden A. ColemanCROWIPaula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 403DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmadsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparejonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.com	C. Coats
Paula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NorLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.coThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmatsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comcomparejonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	D. Burns
Paula A. LaFataBraniffJonathan S. Tam324 NonLindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmatsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comcomparejonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	E & DUNLEVY, PC
Lindsay N. ZanelloOklahorBert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.coThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparejonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.com	Building, Suite 100
Bert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmadsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	th Robinson Avenue
Bert L. WolffTel: 405Mara C. Cusker GonzalezFax: 405DECHERT, LLPsandy.codThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmadsheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.com	na City, OK 73102
DECHERT, LLPsandy.cdThree Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.com	-235-7700
Three Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comhayden.coleman@dechert.compaul.lafata@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	5-272-5269
Three Bryant Parkjoshua.b1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comhayden.coleman@dechert.compaul.lafata@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	oats@crowedunlevy.com
1095 Avenue of the AmericasAttorneyNew York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comComparehayden.coleman@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	urns@crowedunlevy.com
New York, NY 10036Pharmasheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.compaul.lafata@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	s for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue
sheila.birnbaum@dechert.comComparemark.cheffo@dechert.comhayden.coleman@dechert.compaul.lafata@dechert.comjonathan.tam@dechert.comlindsay.zanello@dechert.combert.wolff@dechert.com	Inc., and The Purdue Frederick
mark.cheffo@dechert.com   hayden.coleman@dechert.com   paul.lafata@dechert.com   jonathan.tam@dechert.com   lindsay.zanello@dechert.com   bert.wolff@dechert.com	y Inc.
paul.lafata@dechert.com jonathan.tam@dechert.com lindsay.zanello@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.com	, ,
paul.lafata@dechert.com jonathan.tam@dechert.com lindsay.zanello@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.com	
lindsay.zanello@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.com	
lindsay.zanello@dechert.com bert.wolff@dechert.com	
bert.wolff@dechert.com	
Attorneys for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue	
Pharma Inc., and The Purdue Frederick	
Company Inc.	

Erik W. Snapp Nathan Eric Hoffman DEECHERT, LLP 35 West Wacker Drive, Suite 3400 Chicago, IL 60601 Tel: 212-849-7000 Fax: 212-849-7100 <u>Erik.snapp@dechert.com</u> <u>Nathan.hoffman@dechert.com</u> <u>Attorneys for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue</u> <i>Pharma Inc., and The Purdue Frederick</i> <i>Company Inc.</i>	Robert S. Hoff WIGGIN & DANA, LLP 265 Church Street New Haven, CT 06510 Tel: 203-498-4400 Fax: 203-363-7676 <u>rhoff@wiggin.com</u> <i>Attorneys for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue</i> <i>Pharma Inc., and The Purdue Frederick</i> <i>Company Inc.</i>
Britta E. Stanton John D. Volney John T. Cox, III Eric W. Pinker Jared D. Newsome Jervonne D. Newsome Patrick Brett Disbennett Andrea MeShonn Evans Brown Elizabeth Yvonne Ryan Russell Guy Herman Samuel Butler Hardy, IV Ruben A. Garcia LYNN PINKER COX & HURST, LLP 2100 Ross Avenue, Suite 2700 Dallas, TX 75201 Tel: 214-981-3800 Fax: 214-981-3839 bstanton@lynnllp.com ivolney@lynnllp.com icox@lynnllp.com epinker@lynnllp.com jnewsome@lynnllp.com jnewsome@lynnllp.com sbrown@lynnllp.com eryan@lynnllp.com rherman@lynnllp.com rderia@lynnllp.com sbrown@lynnllp.com rherman@lynnllp.com rherman@lynnllp.com	Benjamin F. McAnaney Rachel Maura Rosenberg Will W. Sachse Hope S. Freiwald Chelsea Marie Nichols Cory A. Ward Meghan Rohling Kelly DECHERT, LLP 2929 Arch Street Philadelphia, PA 19104 Tel: 215-994-4000 Fax: 215-655-2043 benjamin.mcananey@dechert.com Rachel.rosenberg@dechert.com Will.sachse@dechert.com Hope.friewald@dechert.com Chelsea.nichols@dechert.com Meghan.kelly@dechert.com Attorneys for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue Pharma Inc., and The Purdue Frederick Company Inc.

•

William W. Oxley	Harvey Bartle, IV
Dechert LLP	Mark A. Fiore
U.S. Bank Tower	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP
633 West 5 <sup>th</sup> Street, Suite 4900	502 Carnegie Center
Los Angeles, CA 90071-2013	Princeton, NJ 08540-6241
Tel: 213-808-5712	Tel: 609-919-6600
Fax: 213-808-5760	harvey.bartle@morganlewis.com
William.oxley@dechert.com	mark.fiore@morganlewis.com
Attorneys for Purdue Pharma, L.P., Purdue	Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva
Pharma Inc., and The Purdue Frederick	Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson
Company Inc.	Laboratories, /Inc., Actavis LLC, and
	Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson Pharma,
	Inc.
Steven A. Reed	Brian M. Ercole
Steven A. Reed	Dhan M. Elcole
Rebecca J. Hillyer	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
Rebecca J. Hillyer	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 <u>brian.ercole@morganlewis.com</u> <i>Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva</i>
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 <u>steven.reed@morganlewis.com</u>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 <u>steven.reed@morganlewis.com</u> <u>rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com</u>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 <u>brian.ercole@morganlewis.com</u> Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 steven.reed@morganlewis.com rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com evan.jacobs@morganlewis.com	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 <u>steven.reed@morganlewis.com</u> <u>rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com</u> <u>evan.jacobs@morganlewis.com</u> <i>Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva</i>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 <u>steven.reed@morganlewis.com</u> <u>rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com</u> <u>evan.jacobs@morganlewis.com</u> <i>Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva</i> <i>Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson</i>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson
Rebecca J. Hillyer Evan K. Jacobs MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS, LLP 1701 Market Street Philadelphia, PA 19103-2921 <u>steven.reed@morganlewis.com</u> <u>rebecca.hillyer@morganlewis.com</u> <u>evan.jacobs@morganlewis.com</u> <i>Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva</i> <i>Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson</i> <i>Laboratories, /Inc., Actavis LLC, and</i>	MORGAN, LEWIS & BOCKIUS LLP 200 S. Biscaye Blvd., Suite 5300 Miami, FL 33131 brian.ercole@morganlewis.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson

Robert G. McCampbell Nicholas V. Merkley Travis V. Jett Ashlev E. Ouinn Jeffrey A. Curran GABLEGOTWALS One Leadership Square, 15th Floor 211 N. Robinson Oklahoma City, OK 73102 RMcCampbell@Gablelaw.com NMerkley@Gablelaw.com tjett@gablelaw.com aquinn@gablelaw.com JCurran@gablelaw.com Attorneys for Cephalon, Inc., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc., Watson Laboratories, Inc., Actavis LLC, and Actavis Pharma, Inc. f/k/a Watson Pharma, Inc.

Jeffrey Allen Barker Amy J. Laurendeau O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP 610 Newport Center Drive Newport Beach, CA 92660 Tel: 949-823-6900 Fax: 949-823-6994 jbarker@omm.com alaurendeau@omm.com Attorneys for Defendants Janssen Attorneys for Defendants Janssen Attorneys for Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Ortho-McNeil-Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Stephen D. Brody	Vincent S. Weisband
David Roberts	O'Melveny & Myers LLP
Jessica L. Waddle	7 Times Square
Emilie K. Winckel	New York, NY 10036
O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP	Tel: 212-326-2228
1625 Eye Street NW	Fax: 212-326-2061
Washington, DC 20006	vweisband@omm.com
Tel: 202-383-5300	Attorneys for Defendants Janssen
Fax: 202-383-5414	Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Johnson & Johnson,
sbrody@omm.com	Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n /k/a Janssen
droberts2@omm.com	Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Ortho-McNeil-
jwaddle@omm.com	Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen
ewinckel@omm.com	Pharmaceuticals, Inc.
Attorneys for Defendants Janssen	
Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Johnson & Johnson,	
Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n/k/a Janssen	
Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Ortho-McNeil-	
Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen	
Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	
Amy R. Lucas	Justine Marise Daniels
O'MELVENY & MYERS, LLP	O'Melveny & Myers LLP
1999 Avenue of the Stars, 8 <sup>th</sup> Floor	400 South Hope Street
Los Angeles, CA 90067 Tel: 310-553-6700	Los Angeles, CA 90071 Tel: 213-430-7657
Fax: 310-246-6779	Fax: 213-430-6407
<u>alucas@omm.com</u>	jdaniels@omm.com
Attorneys for Defendants Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Johnson & Johnson,	Attorneys for Defendants Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., Johnson & Johnson,
Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc., Jonnson & Jonnson, Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n /k/a Janssen	Janssen Pharmaceutica, Inc. n /k/a Janssen
Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Ortho-McNeil-	Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Ortho-McNeil-
Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Orino-McNell- Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen	Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc., and Orino-McNell- Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen
Pharmaceuticals, Inc. n/k/a Janssen Pharmaceuticals, Inc.	Pharmaceuticals, Inc.

Larry D. Ottaway